MMW 121 – Fall 2014

Comparative Source Analysis Grading Rubric

A  Excellent in all or nearly all aspects of the assignment. In a unified essay, student demonstrates a fairly complete and precise understanding of the content and argument of each of sources. The summaries are complete, specific, clearly written, and well-organized. Student clearly demonstrates the relationship of these sources to the common topic and to each other. This discussion is also clear, well-organized and uses specific examples. Where relevant, student properly and effectively paraphrases, quotes, and uses citations. A good, debatable, perhaps original research question is advanced. Paper is relatively free of errors. A Works Cited page is included.

B  Meets, and at times exceeds, the basic requirements of the assignment and quality of paper is good. In a unified essay, with an introduction that meets the requirements of the prompt, student demonstrates a good, if not always precise, understanding of the content and argument of each source. Student submits a sound summary of the argument in each source, although there might be minor errors. Student demonstrates the relation of these sources to the common topic and to each other; in doing so, the student makes appropriate references to the relevant categories listed in the prompt, and includes some specific examples. This discussion is sound and logical, even if there are some general problems with clarity, lack of specificity, and/or organization. Student advances a relatively good, debatable research question, even if it is not especially original. As relevant, student paraphrases well, and citations are useful and logical. Paper is free of major errors. A Works Cited page is included.

C  Minimally meets all of the basic requirements of the assignment and quality of paper is adequate. Student has submitted a paper that attempts to analyze both assigned sources and meets the minimum page requirements. Essay includes an introduction that minimally meets requirements of the prompt, even if there are errors. Student’s essay includes a general summary of the argument of each source within word limits provided. In addition to the summary of each scholar’s argument, student attempts to analyze the commonalities and differences in the sources as they relate to the topic and each other: student attempts to address relevant categories listed in the prompt. Essay demonstrates a basic understanding of the topic and the scholars’ arguments. Finally, student advances a research question, problematic though it may be. Writing lacks clarity and/or is somewhat problematic. Paper contains some errors. Paper includes citations and a Works Cited page.

D  Minimally meets a few of the basic requirements of the assignment, and the quality of paper is poor. Essay may adequately addressing one source, but not the other, OR, essay may inadequately address both sources. Student demonstrates minimal attempt to summarize the argument of each source (i.e., too many quotations or summary doesn’t address argument) and minimal understanding of each scholar’s argument. Student has also made minimal and problematic attempts to discuss the relation of these sources to the topic or to each other. Paper is poorly organized, too short/too long, and/or writing is very problematic. There may not be a debatable research question. Paper contains numerous errors. Student neglects to cite where necessary.

F  Meets few, if any, of the basic requirements of the assignment. In addition to D criteria above, paper does not address assigned sources, contains no citations or is significantly too short, or writing is incomprehensible.

Standard Deductions. The MMW Style Sheet explains the standard deductions for common problems including formatting issues, page number limitations, spelling/grammar problems, documentation errors, etc.

Rubric key = If one or more of the basic requirements (see bolded criteria in C grade) is missing, the grade should be reduced by one full letter grade

10.31.13 hkl